



OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL STATE OF ILLINOIS

Lisa Madigan ATTORNEY GENERAL

September 16, 2008

John T. Therriault, Assistant Clerk Illinois Pollution Control Board James R. Thompson Center, Ste. 11-500 100 West Randolph Chicago, Illinois 60601

People v. Carlyle North Water Company, Inc.

PCB No. 07-148

Dear Clerk Gunn:

Enclosed for filing please find the original and ten copies of a Notice of Filing, Motion for Relief from Hearing Requirement and Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement in regard to the above-captioned matter. Please file the originals and return file-stamped copies to me in the enclosed, self-addressed envelope.

Thank you for your cooperation and consideration.

Very truly yours,

∯.L. Homan

Environmental Bureau 500 South Second Street Springfield, Illinois 62706

(217) 782-9031

JLH/pjk **Enclosures**

BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD					
PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS,		IS,)		
\$	Complainant,))		
	vs.) PCB No. 07-148	3	
CARLYLE NORTH WATER COMPAINC., an Illinois corporation,		NY,)) (Enforcement))		
	Respondents.)			
	J	NOTIC	E OF FILING	RECEIVED CLERK'S OFFICE	
To:	Carlyle North Water Company c/o Richard A. Kuiken, R.A. 541 9 th Street Carlyle, IL 62231-1824	Inc.		SEP 1 9 2008	
				STATE OF ILLINOIS Pollution Control Board	
	PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that on this date I mailed for filing with the Clerk of the Pollution				
Control Board of the State of Illinois, a MOTION FOR RELIEF FROM HEARING REQUIREMENT					
and STIPULATION AND PROPOSAL FOR SETTLEMENT, copies of which are attached hereto					
and he	erewith served upon you.				
			Respectfully sub	mitted,	
			PEOPLE OF TH	E STATE OF ILLINOIS	
			LISA MADIGAN, Attorney Genera State of Illinois		
			MATTHEW J. DI Environmental E Litigation Division	nforcement/Asbestos	
				//AN Attorney General ental Bureau	
Spring	outh Second Street Ifield, Illinois 62706 32-9031				

Dated: September 16, 2008

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I did on September 16, 2008, send by First Class Mail, with postage thereon fully prepaid, by depositing in a United States Post Office Box a true and correct copy of the following instruments entitled NOTICE OF FILING, MOTION FOR RELIEF FROM HEARING REQUIREMENT and STIPULATION AND PROPOSAL FOR SETTLEMENT:

To: Carlyle North Water Company, Inc. c/o Richard A. Kuiken, R.A. 541 9th Street Carlyle, IL 62231-1824

and the original and ten copies by First Class Mail with postage thereon fully prepaid of the same foregoing instrument(s):

To: John T. Therriault, Assistant Clerk Illinois Pollution Control Board James R. Thompson Center Suite 11-500 100 West Randolph Chicago, Illinois 60601

A copy was also sent by First Class Mail with postage thereon fully prepaid to:

Carol Webb Hearing Officer Illinois Pollution Control Board 1021 North Grand Avenue East Springfield, IL 62794

J. L. HOMAN

Assistant Attorney General

This filing is submitted on recycled paper.

BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, Complainant,)))	
vs. CARLYLE NORTH WATER COMPANY,)) PCB No. 07-148) (Enforcement))	RECEIVED CLERK'S OFFICE
INC., an Illinois corporation,))	SEP 1 9 2008
Respondents.	·)	STATE OF ILLINOIS

MOTION FOR RELIEF FROM HEARING REQUIREMENT

NOW COMES Complainant, PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, by LISA MADIGAN, Attorney General of the State of Illinois, and pursuant to Section 31(c)(2) of the Illinois Environmental Protection Act ("Act"), 415 ILCS 5/31(c)(2) (2006), moves that the Illinois Pollution Control Board grant the parties in the above-captioned matter relief from the hearing requirement imposed by Section 31(c)(1) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/31(c)(1) (2006). In support of this motion, Complainant states as follows:

- 1. The parties have reached agreement on all outstanding issues in this matter.
- 2. This agreement is presented to the Board in a Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement, filed contemporaneously with this motion.
- 3. All parties agree that a hearing on the Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement is not necessary, and respectfully request relief from such a hearing as allowed by Section 31(c)(2) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/31(c)(2) (2006).

WHEREFORE, Complainant, PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, hereby requests that the Board grant this motion for relief from the hearing requirement set forth in Section 31(c)(1) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/31(c)(1) (2006).

Respectfully submitted,

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS LISA MADIGAN ATTORNEY GENERAL

MATTHEW J. DUNN, Chief Environmental Enforcement/Asbestos Litigation Division

J. L. HOMAN

Environmental Bureau Assistant Attorney General

500 South Second Street Springfield, Illinois 62706 217/782-9031

Dated: September 16, 2008

BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD				
PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS,))			
v. CARLYLE NORTH WATER COMPANY, INC., an Illinois not-for-profit corporation,	PCB NO. 07-148 CLERK'S OFFICE (Enforcement) SEP 1 9 2008 STATE OF ILLINOIS Pollution Control Board			
Respondent.)			

STIPULATION AND PROPOSAL FOR SETTLEMENT

Complainant, PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS, by LISA MADIGAN, Attorney General of the State of Illinois, the Illinois Environmental Protection Agency ("Illinois EPA"), and CARLYLE NORTH WATER COMPANY, INC., an Illinois not-for-profit corporation, ("Respondent"), have agreed to the making of this Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement ("Stipulation") and submit it to the Illinois Pollution Control Board ("Board") for approval. This stipulation of facts is made and agreed upon for purposes of settlement only and as a factual basis for the Board's approval of this Stipulation and issuance of relief. None of the facts stipulated herein shall be introduced into evidence in any other proceeding regarding the violations of the Illinois Environmental Protection Act ("Act"), 415 ILCS 5/1 et seq. (2006), and the Board's Regulations, alleged in the Complaint except as otherwise provided herein. It is the intent of the parties to this Stipulation that it be a final adjudication of this matter.

I. STATEMENT OF FACTS

A. Parties to the Stipulation

- 1. On June 28, 2007, a Complaint was filed on behalf of the People of the State of Illinois by Lisa Madigan, Attorney General of the State of Illinois, on her own motion and upon the request of the Illinois EPA, pursuant to Section 31 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/31 (2006), against the Respondent.
- 2. The Illinois EPA is an administrative agency of the State of Illinois, created pursuant to Section 4 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/4 (2006).
- 3. At all times relevant to the Complaint, Respondent was and is an Illinois not-for-profit corporation that is authorized to transact business in the State of Illinois. At all times relevant to the Complaint, Respondent was a water district located near the City of Carlyle and the Village of Keyesport, Clinton County, Illinois ("Site").
- 4. The Respondent supplies water to rural users near the City of Carlyle and the Village of Keyesport. The Respondent receives its water from the City of Carlyle public water supply.
- 5. On or before August 16, 2004, a water main extension was improperly connected to the Respondent's water system.
- 6. From a review of Illinois EPA records, it appears that Respondent's certified operator, Travis Sanders, did not have a valid Class C drinking water certificate from July 1, 2004, until March 22, 2005, but Mr. Sanders continued to serve as Respondent's water operator during that time.
 - 7. From a review of Illinois EPA records, it appears that Respondent failed to

submit, or submitted in an untimely fashion, numerous required reports such as coliform samples (April 2004), monthly operating reports (October 2004 to approximately June 2007), monthly chlorination operating records (October 2004 to approximately June 2007), and monthly fluoride operating records (October 2004 to approximately June 2007).

B. Allegations of Non-Compliance

Complainant and the Illinois EPA contend that the Respondent has violated the following provisions of the Act and Board regulations:

Count I: Violation of Section 15 and 18 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/15,

18 (2006), and 35 Ill. Adm. Code 602.101, 652.101.

Count II: Violation of Section 1 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/45.1 (2006),

and 35 Ill. Adm. Code 603.102.

Count III: Violation of Sections 18 and 19 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/18,

19, and 35 Ill. Adm. Code 611.521, 611.831, 653.605,

653.704 (2006).

C. Admission of Violations

The Respondent neither admits nor denies the violations alleged in the Complaint filed in this matter and referenced herein.

D. Compliance Activities to Date

Respondent has a correctly certified water operator. Respondent has also submitted the missing and/or untimely records/reports. Respondent has instituted a new policy regarding submittal of monthly operating reports designed to address previous late filing problems.

Respondent has submitted "as built" plans for the water main extension, and submitted the required test results. Those "as built" plans have been deemed acceptable by the Illinois EPA.

II. APPLICABILITY

This Stipulation shall apply to and be binding upon the Complainant, the Illinois EPA and the Respondent, and any officer, director, agent, or employee of the Respondent, as well as any successors or assigns of the Respondent. The Respondent shall not raise as a defense to any enforcement action taken pursuant to this Stipulation the failure of any of its officers, directors, agents, employees or successors or assigns to take such action as shall be required to comply with the provisions of this Stipulation. This Stipulation may be used against the Respondent in any subsequent enforcement action or permit proceeding as proof of a past adjudication of violation of the Act and the Board Regulations for all violations alleged in the Complaint in this matter, for purposes of Sections 39 and 42 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/39 and 42 (2006).

III. IMPACT ON THE PUBLIC RESULTING FROM ALLEGED NON-COMPLIANCE

Section 33(c) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/33(c)(2006), provides as follows:

In making its orders and determinations, the Board shall take into consideration all the facts and circumstances bearing upon the reasonableness of the emissions, discharges, or deposits involved including, but not limited to:

- 1. the character and degree of injury to, or interference with the protection of the health, general welfare and physical property of the people;
- 2. the social and economic value of the pollution source;
- 3. the suitability or unsuitability of the pollution source to the area in which it is located, including the question of priority of location in the area involved;

- 4. the technical practicability and economic reasonableness of reducing or eliminating the emissions, discharges or deposits resulting from such pollution source; and
- 5. any subsequent compliance.

In response to these factors, the parties to this Stipulation state the following:

- 1. Human health and the environment were threatened and the Illinois EPA's information gathering responsibilities hindered by the Respondent's violations.
 - 2. There is social and economic benefit to the facility.
 - 3. Operation of the facility was suitable for the area in which it occurred.
- 4. Obtaining a permit prior to construction at the site and compliance with its terms is both technically practicable and economically reasonable. Having a properly certified operator at al times was technically practicable and economically reasonable. Also, filing the records/reports in a timely fashion was both technically practicable and economically reasonable.
 - 5. Respondent has subsequently complied with the Act and the Board Regulations.

IV. CONSIDERATION OF SECTION 42(h) FACTORS

Section 42(h) of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/42(h)(2006), provides as follows:

In determining the appropriate civil penalty to be imposed under . . . this Section, the Board is authorized to consider any matters of record in mitigation or aggravation of penalty, including but not limited to the following factors:

- 1. the duration and gravity of the violation;
- 2. the presence or absence of due diligence on the part of the respondent in attempting to comply with requirements of this Act and regulations thereunder or to secure relief therefrom as provided by this Act;

- 3. any economic benefits accrued by the respondent because of delay in compliance with requirements, in which case the economic benefits shall be determined by the lowest cost alternative for achieving compliance;
- 4. the amount of monetary penalty which will serve to deter further violations by the respondent and to otherwise aid in enhancing voluntary compliance with this Act by the respondent and other persons similarly subject to the Act;
- 5. the number, proximity in time, and gravity of previously adjudicated violations of this Act by the respondent;
- 6. whether the respondent voluntarily self-disclosed, in accordance with subsection i of this Section, the non-compliance to the Agency; and
- 7. whether the respondent has agreed to undertake a "supplemental environmental project," which means an environmentally beneficial project that a respondent agrees to undertake in settlement of an enforcement action brought under this Act, but which the respondent is not otherwise legally required to perform.

In response to these factors, the parties to this Stipulation state as follows:

- 1. The Respondent failed to obtain a permit for operation of the extension of the water line prior to connection. The Respondent failed to have a properly certified operator at all times. The Respondent failed to file all required reports/records in a timely manner. The violations began on or around October, 2004 (records/reports), on or around August 2004 (water line extension), and on or about July 1, 2004 (failure to have a properly certified operator), and were individually resolved at various time sin the following few years.
- 2. Respondent was diligent in attempting to come back into compliance with the Act, Board regulations and applicable federal regulations, once the Illinois EPA notified it of its noncompliance.
 - 3. The Respondent received some economic benefit from noncompliance; however,

any benefit realized from noncompliance has been more than offset by the costs of returning to compliance.

- 4. Complainant and the Illinois EPA have determined, based upon the specific facts of this matter, that a penalty of Three Thousand Seven Hundred Thirteen Dollars (\$3,713.00) will serve to deter further violations and aid in future voluntary compliance with the Act and Board regulations.
- 5. To Complainant's and the Illinois EPA's knowledge, Respondent has no previously adjudicated violations of the Act.
 - 6. Self-disclosure is not at issue in this matter.
- 7. The settlement of this matter does not include a supplemental environmental project.

V. TERMS OF SETTLEMENT

A. Penalty Payment

1. The Respondent shall pay a civil penalty in the sum of Three Thousand Seven Hundred Thirteen Dollars (\$3,713.00) within thirty (30) days from the date the Board adopts and accepts this Stipulation.

B. Stipulated Penalties, Interest and Default

1. If the Respondent fails to make any payment required by this Stipulation on or before the date upon which the payment is due, the Respondent shall be in default and the remaining unpaid balance of the penalty, plus any accrued interest, shall be due and owing

immediately. In the event of default, the Complainant shall be entitled to reasonable costs of collection, including reasonable attorney's fees.

2. Pursuant to Section 42(g) of the Act, interest shall accrue on any penalty amount owed by the Respondent not paid within the time prescribed herein. Interest on unpaid penalties shall begin to accrue from the date such are due and continue to accrue to the date full payment is received. Where partial payment is made on any penalty amount that is due, such partial payment shall be first applied to any interest on unpaid penalties then owing.

C. Payment Procedures

All payments required by this Stipulation shall be made by certified check or money order payable to the Illinois EPA for deposit into the Environmental Protection Trust Fund ("EPTF"). Payments shall be sent by certified mail and delivered to:

Illinois Environmental Protection Agency Fiscal Services 1021 North Grand Avenue East P.O. Box 19276 Springfield, IL 62794-9276

The name, case number and the Respondent's federal tax identification number shall appear on the face of the certified check or money order. A copy of the certified check or money order and any transmittal letter shall be sent to:

> Environmental Bureau Illinois Attorney General's Office 500 South Second Street Springfield, Illinois 62706

D. Future Compliance

This Stipulation in no way affects the responsibilities of the Respondent to comply with any other federal, state or local laws or regulations, including but not limited to the Act and the Board Regulations.

E. Release from Liability

In consideration of the Respondent's payment of the \$3,713.00 penalty, and any specified costs and accrued interest, completion of all activities required hereunder, and upon the Board's approval of this Stipulation, the Complainant releases, waives and discharges the Respondent from any further liability or penalties for the violations of the Act and Board Regulations that were the subject matter of the Complaint herein. The release set forth above does not extend to any matters other than those expressly specified in Complainant's Complaint filed on June 28, 2007. The Complainant reserves, and this Stipulation is without prejudice to, all rights of the State of Illinois against the Respondent with respect to all other matters, including but not limited to, the following:

- a. criminal liability;
- b. liability for future violation of state, federal, local, and common laws and/or regulations;
 - c. liability for natural resources damage arising out of the alleged violations; and
- d. liability or claims based on the Respondent's failure to satisfy the requirements of this Stipulation.

Nothing in this Stipulation is intended as a waiver, discharge, release, or covenant not to sue for any claim or cause of action, administrative or judicial, civil or criminal, past or future, in

law or in equity, which the State of Illinois or the Illinois EPA may have against any person, as defined by Section 3.315 of the Act, 415 ILCS 5/3.315, or entity other than the Respondent.

F. Enforcement and Modification of Stipulation

1. Upon the entry of the Board's Order approving and accepting this Stipulation, that Order is a binding and enforceable order of the Board and may be enforced as such through any and all available means.

G. Execution of Stipulation

The undersigned representatives for each party to this Stipulation certify that they are fully authorized by the party whom they represent to enter into the terms and conditions of this Stipulation and to legally bind them to it.

WHEREFORE, the parties to this Stipulation request that the Board adopt and accept the

foregoing Stipulation and Proposal for Settlement as written.

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS,

FOR THE ILLINOIS ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

LISA MADIGAN Attorney General State of Illinois

DOUGLAS P. SCOTT, Director Illinois Environmental Protection Agency

Chief Legal Counsel

MATTHEW J. DUNN, Chief Environmental Enforcement/ Asbestos Litigation Division

BY:

THOMAS D. VIS, Chief Environment Bureau

Assistant Atteney General

DATE: 9/15/08

DATE:

DAT

CARLYLE NORTH VATER COMPANY, I NC., Illinois

not-for-profit corpor: ion,

DATE: <u>7-21-08</u>

/

 $\mathbf{R}\mathbf{v}$.

ame: JOA

Lucas.